Reorienting Orientalism: Resistance and response in contemporary art and education

Manisha Sharma, PhD
University of North Texas

Asli Kinsizer, PhD
University of Central Arkansas

ABSTRACT

In this paper, we address the question: How can art education reinforce and resist reiterations of Orientalism in multicultural and globalist curriculum in the current moment? (Raza, 2022). We explore how intersectional feminist art education can actively reorient the impacts of Orientalism, resisting and countering the harms of the Orientalist gaze through critical pedagogy, contemporary art practices, and discursive methodologies. Drawing on a conceptual framework layering Homi Bhabha's hybridity and Third Space (1994), Jacques Derrida's ethics of hospitality (2000), and Julia Kristeva's theory of abjection (1982), we examine how these ideas intertwine to offer a model for teaching global visual culture that reorients narratives of representation toward plurality, critical engagement, and ethical hospitality. Using case studies from contemporary artists, we provide practical strategies for educators to disrupt stereotypical visual representations and engage students in feminist dialogue. The paper also advocates for the World Café Method (Brown et al., 2005) as a structured conversational pedagogical model that allows students to collectively unpack complex images and histories.

KEYWORDS: Orientalism, non-western art, Global South, world café methodology, identity and perception, alternative narratives, representation, feminism.

Introduction: Why Reorienting Orientalism Matters

Orientalism refers to the way the West has historically depicted the East as exotic, inferior, and mysterious, reinforcing colonial ideologies and power structures (Said, 1979). These stereotypes and biases persist today, shaping how non-Western cultures are represented in museums, media, and art education curricula (Sharma & Alexander, 2023). In a moment where diversity, equity, and inclusion are under attack as initiatives and as moral imperatives, it is more crucial than ever for critical and caring educators (hooks, 1994; Ladson-Billings, 2005; Noddings, 2005) to develop pedagogical tools that empower students to challenge reductive depictions and engage with art in ethically responsible ways. This paper presents a reorientation of Orientalism, offering a framework that moves beyond critique to provide constructive strategies for resisting and countering its harms. By integrating three key theoretical lenses, namely hybridity (Bhabha, 1994), hospitality (Derrida, 2000), and abjection (Kristeva, 1982), we propose an approach that helps educators and students navigate cultural representations with greater nuance, openness, and ethical responsibility.

We demonstrate how applying the World Café Method (Brown et al., 2005) as a pragmatic and innovative discussion-based approach fosters collaborative learning and critical dialogue around issues of representation, power, and identity. By implementing this method, educators can create classroom spaces that encourage reflection, conversation, and decolonial engagement with visual culture.

To provide some context, this paper emerged as a result of our dialogues working together as mentor (Sharma) and advisee (Kinsizer) on the latter's doctoral research project in the time immediately after the covid-19 pandemic, during the growing severity of the armed conflicts in Gaza and Ukraine and into the dawn of the current United States administration. So, while the topic and methodology strongly reference Kinsizer's dissertation research, this timing greatly influenced our extending the conceptual framework of this paper around perceptions of strangeness, hospitality, abjection, and marginality, and the voicing and silencing of them in contemporary society.

The early sections of this paper foreground a theoretical and visual-cultural rethinking of Orientalism, and presents South Asian feminist artist examples to suggest inroads into different geographies than the specifically US and Turkish example of the case study presented in the second half of the paper, which turns to a pedagogical model Kinsizer's World Café case study that operationalizes these theoretical concepts in classroom practice. To avoid separating these strands into disconnected conversations, we frame the World Café as a methodological

extension rather than an addendum to the theory. Kinsizer's dissertation research demonstrated that students' interpretations of Orientalist and feminist artworks shift significantly when dialogue occurs within a structured, collaborative environment shaped by principles of hybridity, hospitality, and intersectional critique. For this reason, we introduce the World Café study earlier as a pedagogical instantiation of the conceptual framework, illustrating how students themselves participated in reorienting Orientalist perceptions through dialogic, multimodal engagement.

Reframing Orientalism: Incorporating Feminist and Queer Perspectives

Orientalism has long been critiqued by feminist and queer scholars who emphasize how gender and sexuality intersect with colonial representations of the East. For example, Meyda Yeğenoğlu (1998) extends Said's framework by interrogating how Orientalism functions through a gendered lens, particularly in the stereotypical construction of the veiled Muslim woman as the ultimate "other". Yeğenoğlu argues that Western representations of the veil are not merely about cultural difference but serve as a projection of Western anxieties about sexuality and control. This type of gendered Orientalism reduces vast swathes of women to either oppressed victims or exoticized objects of desire, denying them agency in their own cultural narratives.

Similarly, Reina Lewis (2004, 2013) explores the role of gender and Orientalism in shaping visual culture, highlighting how female artists and writers have historically navigated and resisted these discourses. Lewis critiques how Western feminism has often perpetuated Orientalist assumptions by positioning Middle Eastern and South Asian women as passive subjects in need of rescue. Instead, she argues for an approach that acknowledges the complex self-representations and resistances of non-Western women themselves (Lewis, 2004).

From a queer theoretical perspective, Joseph Massad (2008) critiques the homonationalist gaze, which Orientalizes queer identities in non-Western contexts by framing them as either victims of oppressive traditions or as needing Western intervention to "liberate" them. Massad problematizes the Eurocentric assumptions that frame queerness as inherently Western, arguing that this erases the diverse and culturally specific expressions of gender and sexuality in the Middle East and South Asia (Massad, 2008).

Queer feminist scholar Evelyn Alsultany (2011) further complicates Orientalist narratives in media representation, emphasizing how contemporary depictions of Arab and Muslim identities remain trapped

between terrorist stereotypes and progressive assimilationist narratives. These representations, Alsultany argues, flatten complex identities and leave little room for nuanced understandings of intersectionality and agency.

By incorporating these feminist and queer perspectives, we align ourselves with fellow scholars who move beyond Said's foundational critique to examine and restate how Orientalism operates (Hallaq, 2018) through gender, sexuality, and race in ways that continue to inform art and media representations today.

Theoretical Framework: Hybridity, Hospitality, and Abjection as Tools for Resistance

To effectively counter Orientalism, we find it necessary to move beyond critiques of its historical legacy and offer alternative ways of seeing, interpreting, and teaching art. We therefore intertwine conceptual explorations of Homi Bhabha, Jacques Derrida, and Julia Kristeva to provide an intellectual foundation for this reorientation.

Homi Bhabha: Hybridity, Third Space, and Strangers in a Strange Land

Bhabha's Third Space theory (Bhabha, 2004b) challenges binary divisions between the colonizer and colonized, proposing that meaning is always produced through negotiation, translation, and hybridity. Instead of seeing cultures as fixed and separate, Bhabha argues that they are fluid, evolving through interaction and exchange, as exemplified in the colonizer's viewpoints and experience being changed as well as that of the colonized. One of Bhabha's critical contributions in this area is his articulation of the experience of strangers finding themselves in a strange land, which speaks to the displacement, negotiation, and identity formation of individuals who exist between cultures. This resonates with postcolonial subjects, immigrants, and diasporic artists who navigate contradictory cultural identities and challenge dominant representations of selfhood. For Bhabha, the stranger disrupts established narratives, becoming a figure of cultural hybridity who unsettles fixed meanings (Bhabha, 1994). In this sense, the stranger is not merely an outsider but a critical agent of change, redefining the cultural landscape through their presence and creative engagement.

In the context of resisting Orientalism, this implies that non-Western artifacts, artists and scholars are not merely strange(r) subjects of the Western gaze but active participants in shaping their own representation. When contemporary artists from Turkey, South Asia, and the Middle East reinterpret and subvert Orientalist imagery, they occupy

this Third Space, creating new meanings that challenge and complicate Western expectations. For example, Pakistani artist Shahzia Sikander blends traditional Indo-Persian miniature painting with contemporary feminist themes, resisting the colonial framing of South Asian aesthetics (McNay, 2022). Similarly, Turkish artist İnci Eviner's video installations reinterpret the harem motif, transforming passive Orientalist depictions into dynamic sites of agency and critique (Eviner, 2009).

Jacques Derrida: Hospitality as an Ethical Response to the "Stranger"

Derrida's ethics of hospitality (Derrida & Dufourmantelle, 2000) provides us with another significant perspective for reorienting Orientalism, although Derrida does not explicitly do this himself. Hospitality, in Derrida's view, is both an invitation and a challenge. This is an inherently paradoxical idea as it demands openness to the Other but also requires self-reflection on the conditions under which the Other is welcomed or excluded. Even as it invites, it simultaneously institutes boundaries of exclusion, marking the limits of our invitations.

In the context of art education, hospitality involves including diverse artistic traditions in curricula and speaking to a diverse body of students and actively engaging with them through a self-reflexive ethics of encounter, with questions that ask: In this space and time, who is allowed to speak? With what nuance? Who is granted authority to represent a culture? How is (this) pedagogical space a site of both welcome and resistance? In this way, we activate Derrida's articulation of unconditional hospitality to explore how students engage with unfamiliar or contentious images of the 'Other' in art and visual culture, because a self-respecting decolonizing pedagogy of hospitality does not simply 'include' diverse perspectives to represent them; it actively challenges inherent power imbalances and invites dialogue on representation, appropriation, and authority to disrupt and dismantle the consequences of colonialism in culture and society by seeking clarification on who gets to feel at home in a given space.

Julia Kristeva: Strangeness, Abjection, and Reclaiming the Gaze

Kristeva's theory of abjection (Kristeva, 1982) describes how societies define themselves by expelling what they consider foreign, impure, or threatening. Orientalism has long positioned non-Western bodies as sites of both fascination and fear, rendering them hyper-visible yet politically voiceless. Contemporary feminist artists resist this abjection by reclaiming the gaze. For instance, Canan's photographic series *Turkish Delight (x-Ist*, 2011) plays with Orientalist clichés of the harem but flips the power dynamic, making the women in her images conscious and commanding subjects rather than passive objects.

In juxtaposition, Bhabha, Derrida, and Kristeva provide a sound theoretical roadmap for art educators seeking to help students authentically engage with representation, challenge stereotypes, and foster cross-cultural understanding. These three theoretical lenses: Bhabha's Third Space, Derrida's hospitality, and Kristeva's abjection, not only shape the way contemporary artists continue to resist Orientalist imagery but also inform the pedagogical design of Kinsizer's empirical study. In Kinsizer's dissertation, these concepts emerged organically in student dialogue as participants negotiated strangeness, belonging, resistance, and power while examining both Orientalist and contemporary feminist artworks. Kinsizer intentionally chose The World Café methodology because it mirrors the fluid, negotiated, and ethically reflexive spaces described by these theorists, and offers a way to activate the theory-practice loop. Thus, the conceptual and methodological framework provides the intellectual architecture through which students engage with images and with one another. The next section extends this alignment by demonstrating how contemporary women artists create the very Third Spaces that later became sites of student inquiry in the World Café sessions.

Contemporary Artistic Interventions: Contesting Orientalist Representations of Women's Spaces

A recurring motif in Orientalist art is the depiction of (non-western/ Global South) women's spaces such as harems, courtyards, and domestic interiors as sites of sensuality, confinement, and exotic spectacle. These images, primarily created by Western male artists who were sometimes given access to the actual spaces but often not, worked from their fantasy and imagination and reduced women's lives to passive, decorative existences, removing their agency and voice. In this paper, we highlight contemporary artists working from within South Asia and the Middle East actively contest these representations, reclaiming women's spaces as sites of resistance, redefinition, and narrative complexity and offering strong counterpoints to the now "classical" images of western canonical images. We offer these as teaching resources as art teachers and cultural makers persist in teaching with "classical" images of Ingres, Delacroix and their ilk, often unchallenged or without counterpoints. In this next section, we present examples of significant female artists whose work offers critical resistance and counterpoints to the male Orientalist gaze, within our conceptual framework, drawing from our originary cultural knowledge.

Shahzia Sikander (Pakistan/U.S.): Reinterpreting Mughal Miniature Painting

Shahzia Sikander's work (Sikander, n.d) reclaims the Mughal miniature tradition, which has historically been appropriated by colonial archives to frame South Asian aesthetics through a Western lens. Sikander subverts the rigidity of traditional miniature painting, introducing fluidity and layered narratives that disrupt linear, monolithic depictions of gender and power. Her work frequently explores migration, identity, and the body in flux, complicating the Eurocentric tendency to depict Eastern figures as static and timeless.

Using Bhabha's perspective (Bhabha, 2004a) Sikander's practice inhabits a Third Space, where the boundaries between tradition and modernity blur, making room for new hybrid forms of identity and belonging. Her art therefore serves as a site of cultural negotiation, resisting colonialist visual control by reappropriating artistic language on her own terms. In an art education context, her work provides students with an example of how tradition can be reimagined as a tool of agency, rather than a constraint of inherited identity / identification.

Nalini Malani (India): Addressing Colonial and Patriarchal Violence

Nalini Malani's practice (*Nalini Malani - Installations*, 2025) engages with themes of historical trauma, gendered violence, and postcolonial memory (Iyengar, 2018; Malani, 1996, 2005). Her immersive video installations and shadow plays bring visibility to erased histories of female suffering, particularly in the context of partition, forced migration, and systemic patriarchy. In her artworks, Malani speaks back to Orientalist depictions of oppressed Eastern women by centering their voices, movements, and struggles and recontextualizing them within contemporary oppressions, thus creating an aesthetic language that disrupts the viewer's passive gaze.

Kristeva's notion of abjection is particularly relevant here. Malani's artworks refuse to sanitize or aestheticize pain, instead presenting fragments, distortions, and specters of history that resist easy consumption (Kristeva & Herman, 2010). Within art education, her work serves as a powerful entry point for discussions on how visual culture can either erase or reclaim marginalized histories and how the representation of pain must be approached with ethical responsibility.

Aisha Khalid (Pakistan): Challenging Gendered Spatial Politics

Aisha Khalid's practice (*All Contemporary Miniature Art Works - Aisha Khalid*, 2025) explores spatiality, enclosure, and agency, particularly through her engagement with Persian and Mughal techniques within contemporary media. While Orientalist art frequently depicted women's quarters as luxurious prisons, Khalid inverts this dynamic, using traditional motifs to reflect on women's autonomy and constraint within both private and public spheres. Her work *Conversations* particularly troubles the ways in which western actions continue to undo the work that brown women do towards changing tired narratives (Khalid, 2002).

Read through Derrida's framework of hospitality, Khalid's work raises questions about who is permitted to enter and exit spaces of power. Her large-scale tapestries and installations challenge viewers to consider the politics of looking, belonging, and restriction, making visible the unequal architectures of gendered experience. In art education, Khalid's work can be used to discuss how spatial design and artistic composition reflect systems of power, particularly in relation to gender, tradition, and mobility.

Canan (Turkey): Feminist Re-imaginings of the Harem as Gendered Spatial Politics

Canan's work actively reverses and ridicules Orientalist harem fantasies, using performance, photography, and multimedia to create images of women who assert power, sexuality, and defiance. Unlike the passive, reclining odalisques of European Orientalist paintings, Canan's figures (See Figure 1) stare back at the viewer, challenging voyeuristic consumption (*x-Ist*, 2011).

Figure 1
Turkish Delight I

Note. Canan (2011), Turkish Delight I, photography, 70x100c. The lyrics of the video titled Turk Lokumu (Turkish Delight), 2011 are as follows:

Your mind is Orientalist
I am a feminist artist
These images are sexist
Enough, don't be colonialist
This work titled Turkish delight

Drawing from Bhabha's hybridity and Kristeva's abjection (Bhabha, 2004b; Putzer, 2021), Canan plays with the grotesque, the surreal, and the excessive to disrupt the sanitized eroticism of Orientalist fantasy. Her work serves as a compelling case study for art educators looking to discuss gender, performativity, and the politics of self-representation. How do images change when subjects become authors of their own narratives rather than objects of another's gaze? Kinsizer offers a model of what the application of Canan's work looks like in art education. (Kinsizer, 2024).

İnci Eviner (Turkey): Using Video Installations to Reclaim Agency from an Orientalist lens

İnci Eviner's practice interrogates the surveillance, fragmentation, and policing of female bodies in both historical and contemporary contexts.

Her video installations reimagine harem scenes as sites of disruption, where women engage in absurd, resistant, and unscripted behaviors—contrasting sharply with the stillness and control of Orientalist compositions (See Figure 2).

Figure 2
Harem by Inci Eviner (2009)

Note. Single channel HD video, 3' loop, video installment. Taken from https://www.incieviner.net/en/harem-2009.html.

From a Derridean perspective, Eviner's work problematizes who is granted visibility and who is excluded in dominant narratives. The ordinary notion of hospitality is turned on its head, as the familiar spaces of Orientalist imagery become unrecognizable, filled with ruptures and distortions. These are based on (a) the contradictions and paradoxes of subjectivity and objectification in the image and (b) who is most at home in representing images of being 'at home' somewhere (Derrida & Dufourmantelle, 2000). In an educational setting, her practice can be explored to discuss how performative and digital media can be used as methods of resistance, particularly in responding to historical images that have sought to define and limit identities. Kinsizer offers a model of what the application of Canan's work looks like in art education. (Kinsizer, 2024) The contemporary artists discussed above (Sikander, Malani, Khalid, Canan, and Eviner) actively disrupt Orientalist visual constructions by reimagining women's agency, spatial politics, and

subjectivity. Kinsizer's dissertation research revealed that these same artworks became productive catalysts for student dialogue, prompting participants to grapple with hybridity, cultural memory, the ethics of looking, and the politics of representation. For students, these artworks functioned as "threshold images" that opened the possibility for meaning-making beyond inherited Orientalist frames of looking. This alignment between artistic intervention and pedagogical inquiry underscores why the World Café methodology is introduced here: it provided a structured, dialogic space for students to encounter the ambiguities, resistances, and negotiations embodied in the artworks themselves. In this way, the World Café served as a pedagogical replication of the theoretical and artistic Third Spaces explored earlier.

The World Café Methodology: A Dialogic Approach to Art Education

The World Café Methodology, developed by Brown and Isaacs (Brown et al., 2005), is a structured yet flexible conversational process designed to foster collaborative knowledge production through small-group dialogue. Rooted in Socratic traditions of communal inquiry, it creates hospitable spaces for generative discussions that challenge hierarchical structures of knowledge production. In the context of art education, the World Café offers an invaluable methodology for navigating the complexities of Orientalism, representation, and cultural third spaces in art and visual culture education (Anderson et al., 2023) in the kind of dialogic inquiry we advocate for in the previous section of this essay. Rather than appearing as a separate or secondary component of the paper, the World Café is introduced here as the methodological extension of the ideas of hybridity, hospitality, and ambivalence discussed throughout the theoretical framework and exemplified in the artworks. In the dissertation study, this method enabled students to collectively interrogate Orientalist and feminist Turkish imagery in a hospitable space activating layered, rotating conversations that mirrored the fluidity and negotiated identities central to Bhabha's Third Space. The methodology therefore acts as the hinge connecting theory, artistic resistance, and concrete pedagogical practice.

As Bohm (Bohm, 2013) argues, "Dialogue is a participatory process, where collective meaning unfolds in an organic and emergent manner, allowing each participant to contribute to the transformation of knowledge" (p. 35). The World Café facilitates this process by offering a non-linear, decentralized structure, allowing participants to explore ideas through fluid, evolving conversations rather than rigid academic debate.

We advocate for this methodology here to engage students with the project of re-orienting Orientalism, based on the success of Kinsizer

in implementing it in her own research (Kinsizer, 2025). Kinsizer's dissertation demonstrated that the World Café structure enabled students to move beyond surface-level readings of Orientalist and feminist artworks by engaging in sustained, collective meaning-making. Across groups in Turkey and the United States, participants reported that rotating conversations helped them recognize how their interpretations were shaped by cultural background, gendered assumptions, and inherited visual habits. Many described moments of perceptual "rupture" when hearing peers articulate alternative readings of the same artwork; This is an experience directly aligned with Bhabha's Third Space, Derrida's notion of ethical hospitality, and Kristeva's theorization of abject strangeness. These findings confirm the World Café as a methodological embodiment of the theoretical framework guiding this paper. Integrating these dissertation results here highlights how dialogic pedagogy operates as a critical tool for reorienting Orientalist ways of seeing in contemporary art education.

Methods: How the World Café Works

The World Café operates through a series of rotating, small-group discussions, where participants engage in layered, interwoven conversations on a given topic. The methodology is structured as follows:

- Setting the Café Environment: The space is arranged in an informal, café-like setting to encourage comfort, participation, and creative engagement.
- Small Group Conversations: Participants gather in groups of four to six people, each engaging in focused discussion on a central question related to the session's theme.
- Rotating Conversations: After a set time (typically 15-20 minutes), participants move to a new table, where they build upon previous conversations and expand perspectives.
- Harvesting Insights: In the final stage, all participants convene to share key ideas, revealing patterns, connections, and emergent knowledge.

Reorienting Orientalism through Dialogic Learning

The World Café Methodology provides a vital pedagogical tool for reorienting Orientalism, as it shifts the power dynamics of knowledge production from hierarchical to collaborative engagement. In art education, Orientalist narratives are often presented as historical artifacts or aesthetic traditions but must be critically examined for their embedded colonial ideologies and constructed perceptions of cultural otherness. Through dialogic engagement activated by this methodology and as demonstrated in Kinsizer's research, students learn to:

- Identify the visual tropes of Orientalism (e.g., eroticized harem scenes, passive Eastern figures, and exoticized landscapes).
- Recognize the historical and political context of these representations (e.g., their ties to imperialism, colonial power structures, and Western fantasies of dominance).
- Critique the ways in which these images continue to shape contemporary art, media, and public perceptions of non-Western cultures.

According to Freire (2000), "Education must begin with the solution of the teacher-student contradiction, by reconciling the poles of the contradiction so that both are simultaneously teachers and students" (p. 72). As demonstrated by Kinsizer's research, The World Café embodies this pedagogy of reciprocity, shifting the focus from authority-based instruction to an ecosystem of shared inquiry.

Case Study (Kinsizer's dissertation study findings).

Kinsizer's dissertation explored how diverse college-level student groups engaged in cross-cultural critiques of Orientalist and contemporary Turkish feminist artworks. The research involved three key groups: undergraduate and non-art majors, and pre-service art education students at a public University in the Southern United States, and fine arts students at a university in Turkiye. Using the World Café Methodology (WCM), these students engaged in dialogic group discussions that enabled them to analyze and interpret visual artworks collectively. The goal was to examine how students from differing cultural, disciplinary, and geopolitical contexts respond to visual representations shaped by Orientalism, gender ideologies, and postcolonial narratives. Kinsizer analyzed participant using feminist intersectionality (Crenshaw, 1989) and intertextuality (Kristeva, 1980), identifying how Orientalist ideologies remain embedded in art perception but can be disrupted through dialogic, contextually responsive pedagogy.

Participants engaged with artworks by contemporary Turkish artists such as İnci Eviner and Canan, whose practices resist Orientalist and patriarchal visual traditions. In the dialogue surrounding Eviner's Harem (2009), students from the Turkish University emphasized emotional and psychological confinement. They interpreted the female figures as a metaphor for societal tension, surveillance, and the politics of gendered space. They framed the harem not as a sensual or passive space but as a contested site of disorder, critique, and resistance. These participants questioned whether the women in Eviner's video installation signified fractured solidarity or were an intentional reflection on the lack thereof. This revealed layered engagement with feminist and decolonial ideas. For instance, one student asked, "Is Eviner making

a solidarity statement, or is it lacking?" This nuanced inquiry underlines a critical engagement with both form and cultural symbolism. Conversely, American students, particularly pre-service art teachers, engaged with Eviner's work from a more symbolic and post-structuralist standpoint. While they critiqued the objectifying male gaze and noted parallels with Western Orientalist artworks such as Ingres's The Turkish Bath, their analyses remained largely theoretical, less grounded in lived cultural dynamics. Still, they acknowledged Eviner's visual fragmentation as an act of resistance to imposed coherence and patriarchal order. They also affirm her disruption of traditional Orientalist narratives.

A similar dynamic emerged from Canan's photographic artwork, "Turkish Delight " (2011). Turkish participants identified a deliberate effort to counteract the power dynamics of Orientalist portraiture. One female student noted, "This picture has such strong symbolism," referring to the subject's defiant gaze, casual nudity, and engagement with a book. Turkish students interpreted the piece as a challenge to the Western male gaze, reframing the figure as intellectually and sexually autonomous. Several highlighted the symbolism of the book in contrast to traditional props, such as the peacock fan or luxurious textiles, reframing the woman as a subject of thought rather than a mere object of desire. Others emphasized cultural specificity, noting how Canan's work evokes Turkish hospitality traditionally symbolized by offering Turkish delight, only to critique how women have been metaphorically "served" by the Western gaze.

American students, particularly those in Honors art appreciation, also recognized the defiance in the subject's posture and self-awareness, but emphasized its juxtaposition with familiar Western images, such as Ingres's odalisques. They engaged more with aesthetics and intertextual symbolism than with socio-political critiques, revealing differing interpretive frameworks rooted in educational and geopolitical contexts. This cross-cultural comparison highlighted a critical finding in Kinsizer's research: while all student groups recognized Orientalist tropes and gendered visual hierarchies, Turkish students more readily interpreted contemporary feminist artworks as active cultural and political resistance. American students, by contrast, focused on conceptual disruption within a Euro-American art historical framework. This divergence underscores how lived experiences, national identities, and educational paradigms shape interpretive lenses in art education.

Through the World Café methodology, Kinsizer facilitated dialogues that fostered collaborative meaning-making, allowing students to engage in deep reflection and intercultural critique. The process encouraged students to recognize how dominant cultural narratives shaped

their assumptions, and to explore how contemporary Turkish art intervenes in those narratives. For example, while the pre-service teachers in the USA focused on ambiguities and symbolism, Turkish university participants discussed intersectional feminism, historical erasure, and the geopolitical stakes of visual representation. One Turkish student noted that "Turkey is in limbo" between East and West, an observation that deepens the context of cultural representation and identity.

Thematic coding via a research analysis software (DedooseTM) revealed that the most frequent codes across the data included Orientalist Ideology (372 instances), Intersectional Female Gaze (315 instances), and Modern Criticism (143 instances) (see Figure 3 below).

Figure 3
Overlapping Codes

Codes	FEMINIST INTERSECTIONAL	CULTURAL STEROTYPES	GENDER STEROTYPES	INTERSECTIONALITY	MALE GAZE	INTERSECTIONAL FEMALE GAZE	ART AND REPRESENTATION	MODERN CRITIQUE	WOMEN AGENCY	ORIENTALIST IDEOLOGY (RQ-)	GEOPOLITICAL POSITIONING	HISTORICAL BIAS	ORIENTALISM	VISUAL CULTURE	Totals
FEMINIST INTERSECTIONAL		9	32	12	55	35	12	9	12	39		3	19	12	249
CULTURAL STEROTYPES	9		3			3				6		1	2	2	26
GENDER STEROTYPES	32	3		1	17	8	4	1	2	14		2	9	2	95
INTERSECTIONALITY	12		1		3	10	1	6	6	1					40
MALE GAZE	55		17	3		18	9	3	5	19			12	4	145
INTERSECTIONAL FEMALE GAZE	35	3	8	10	18		40	69	35	47	9	5	22	14	315
ART AND REPRESENTATION	12		4	1	9	40		6	3	12		1	10	4	102
MODERN CRITIQUE	9		1	6	3	69	6		8	21	3	1	9	7	143
WOMEN AGENCY	12		2	6	5	35	3	8		10	3	2	4	2	92
ORIENTALIST IDEOLOGY (RQ-1)	39	6	14	1	19	47	12	21	10		47	14	96	46	372
GEOPOLITICAL POSITIONING						9		3	3	47		4	1	2	69
HISTORICAL BIAS	3	1	2			5	1	1	2	14	4		1	2	36
ORIENTALISM	19	2	9		12	22	10	9	4	96	1	1		6	191
VISUAL CULTURE	12	2	2		4	14	4	7	2	46	2	2	6		103
Totals	249	26	95	40	145	315	102	143	92	372	69	36	191	103	

These findings demonstrate that while Orientalist discourse remains pervasive, students engage with it in increasingly critical and intersectional ways. Notably, Turkish students coded higher frequencies in categories such as Resistance, Agency, and Geopolitical Positioning. This revealed how Turkish feminist artworks serves as a tool of cultural negotiations and identity reclamation.

In conclusion, Kinsizer's research exemplifies how dialogic pedagogical models, such as the World Café, can help students deconstruct Orientalist ideology in art education. By centering on feminist intersectionality, the study provides students with a space to reclaim interpretive agency and challenge systemic visual biases. Contemporary Turkish feminist artists served as focal points for this counter- narrative, offering generative models for how art can critique and transform dominant cultural representations. These findings demonstrate the pedagogical potential of collaborative, cross-cultural engagement in advancing ethical, critical, and decolonial art education.

Application in Art Education: Pedagogical Strategies for Reorienting Orientalism

As demonstrated by the above case study, The World Café methodology allows students across cultural and national contexts to explore Orientalist representations, power, and agency through structured conversation and collective meaning-making. Below are practical applications of the method in art education:

- Critical Pedagogy Seminars: The World Café can effectively be used as a decolonizing teaching tool, where students discursively explore the ethics of representation, hospitality, and strangeness in visual culture in a hospitable third space that rejects estrangement of any participant or cultural perspective.
- Interdisciplinary Collaboration: The method facilitates dialogue between artists, theorists, and educators, fostering cross-disciplinary knowledge production.
- Museum and Curatorial Studies: Participants engage in conversational critiques of museum practices, analyzing how institutions construct and mediate visual narratives.

The World Café as a Decolonial Pedagogical Model

The fluid, non-hierarchical nature of the World Café method makes it a transformative pedagogical model for art education. By embracing open-ended inquiry, intersubjectivity, and dialogic exchange, it resists rigid categories of knowledge, allowing for meaning to emerge through relational interaction. Derrida (2000) reminds us that "hospitality is

never absolute; it must always negotiate the conditions of welcome and the limits of inclusion" (p. 67). The World Café enacts this ethos of contingent hospitality, providing a structured yet fluid framework where students encounter, negotiate, and reframe strangeness. This cultural decolonizing possibility goes beyond using the World Cafe a community building space; As Bhabha (1994) argues, "The Third Space is not a mere hybrid blend, but a site of negotiation, where meanings are contested and redefined" (p. 56). Thus, the World Café functions as a Decolonizing Third Space pedagogy, where students are not merely receivers of knowledge but active agents in meaning-making, challenging dominant epistemic paradigms.

The Transformative Potential of the World Café in Art Education

By integrating dialogue, critical engagement, ethical encounters with representation, and decentralized learning, the World Café represents a radical departure from didactic models of art education. It empowers students to deconstruct colonial narratives and participate in the reorienting and reimagining of Orientalist narratives in art and visual culture. As Bhabha (1994) asserts, "The social articulation of difference is a complex, on-going negotiation that seeks to authorize cultural hybridities" (p. 2). By implementing structured, student-led discussions, art educators can ensure that Orientalism is not merely critiqued but actively dismantled in pedagogical practice.

Kinsizer's research (2025) is a model of this approach that, when applied across varied student demographics and geographies, reveals the nuanced perspectives that might well go unvoiced and unheard, in more traditional approaches to teaching about Orientalism and other impacts of colonialism.

Conclusion

As demonstrated by Kinsizer's investigations, we can effectively reorient art education to be more critical, inclusive, and dialogic by integrating feminist and queer critiques of Orientalism alongside theoretical framings of hybridity, hospitality, and abjection, using the World Café Method of pedagogical engagement. This shift is essential not only for deconstructing Orientalist narratives but for empowering students to actively shape new ways of seeing, interpreting, and engaging with global visual culture, in order to decolonize the ways that we consume it.

Reorienting Orientalism in art education requires far more than critique; it demands sustained engagement with the visual, cultural, and political forces that shape how students perceive difference, identity,

and representation. In this paper, we have demonstrated how a conceptual framework of hybridity, hospitality, and abjection, illustrated through contemporary feminist and queer artistic practices, offers educators powerful tools for disrupting Orientalist narratives. Through Kinsizer's application of The World Café method, we have also shown how these theoretical commitments take shape pedagogically when students engage in collective, dialogic inquiry that foregrounds multiplicity and shared responsibility.

In today's digital landscape, Orientalism circulates rapidly through social media, memes, news images, algorithmic feeds, and AI-generated visual culture. Yet this same digital environment also amplifies resistance. Artists like Sikander, Eviner, and Canan use digital video, animation, and online platforms to reshape global narratives, build transnational feminist solidarities, and challenge misrepresentations. Students encounter these images long before they enter the classroom, making digital literacy essential to decolonial art education. Educators must help students analyze how visual tropes travel online, how they are reproduced or contested in global media, and how digital art practices create new public pedagogies of resistance. Digital platforms thus become both terrains of Orientalist harm and powerful sites for arts-based activism spaces where alternative narratives can be created, circulated, and collectively understood.

To support art educators across varied teaching contexts, we have offered several concrete strategies for implementing decolonial visual literacy. In K–12 settings, teachers can introduce paired image sets Orientalist artworks alongside counter-Orientalist or contemporary feminist reinterpretations to help young learners recognize stereotypes and differentiate them from nuanced representations, using structured dialogue prompts and digital storytelling tools to build context and voice. At the secondary level and within pre-service art education, instructors can integrate feminist, postcolonial, and queer gaze frameworks into critiques and units on global visual culture, positioning students as co-researchers who investigate museum collections, online archives, and media narratives with empathy and critical awareness. Within higher education and teacher preparation programs, critical dialogic pedagogies such as the World Café, affinity mapping, and structured debate can support deeper analysis of visual ideologies, while practice-based research assignments invite pre-service teachers to design interventions or revised lesson plans that challenge Orientalist tropes. Across levels, these approaches encourage students to become active interpreters, critical thinkers, and cultural producers rather than passive consumers of images cultivating art classrooms that foster agency, complexity, and ethical engagement with global visual culture.

Although the World Café offers a compelling structure for dialogic, student-centered learning, it also presents practical and pedagogical challenges. Meaningful participation requires adequate time, flexible space, and an instructor comfortable with facilitating open-ended, emergent conversation conditions that may not always be available in K–12 or higher education settings. Students accustomed to teacher-directed learning may initially resist its collaborative, exploratory nature, and discussions of Orientalism, gender, or representation can generate discomfort or silence in polarized sociopolitical climates. These limitations point not to the method's inadequacy but to the need for thoughtful scaffolding, careful facilitation, and contextual adaptation. Similarly, educators implementing decolonial pedagogy often encounter institutional and community resistance, including curricular constraints favoring the Western canon, administrative pressures to avoid "political" material, and student unease when examining ingrained visual assumptions. As Derrida reminds us, hospitality is always conditional and negotiated. By grounding conversations in visual evidence, contextual research, and reflective dialogue, educators can navigate such tensions and help students understand that critical engagement is not political imposition but a core aspect of visual literacy and ethical art education.

Ultimately, reorienting Orientalism is both a pedagogical and ethical undertaking—one that asks educators and students to sit with the complexities of seeing, knowing, and being in relation with one another. Through the interplay of theory, artistic practice, and dialogic methodology, we can invite students to interrogate how visual culture shapes their assumptions and to recognize how collective interpretation opens pathways for unsettling inherited narratives. In a moment when digital platforms circulate both harm and possibility, and when global feminist art continues to press against the constraints of representation, structured collaborative learning becomes a vital space for imagining otherwise to rehearse forms of public pedagogy grounded in care, critique, and relational accountability.

A decolonial art education is not simply a corrective to historical distortion; it is an activation of students as co-creators of knowledge, capable of envisioning more expansive, inclusive, and nuanced ways of occupying the world. When classrooms function as dialogic, reflexive, and ethically engaged Third Spaces, they enable shifts in perception and identity that gesture toward new forms of cultural agency. Such spaces hold the potential for students to renegotiate what they have inherited, to reclaim what has been obscured, and to participate in building visual and conceptual worlds that refuse the limits imposed by Orientalist frames.

References

Aisha Khalid. (2025, May 26). *All contemporary miniature art works*. https://aishakhalid.com/works-part-1/

Alsultany, E. (2011). *Arabs and Muslims in the media: Race and representation after 9/11.* NYU Press.

Anderson, G. L., Desai, D., Heras, A. I., & Spreen, C. A. (2023). *Creating third spaces of learning for post-capitalism: Lessons from educators, artists, and activists* (1st ed.). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003345015

Bhabha, H. K. (2004a). How newness enters the world. In *The location of culture* (2nd ed., pp. 303–337). Routledge.

Bhabha, H. K. (2004b). *The location of culture* (2nd ed.). Routledge.

Bohm, D. (2013). *On dialogue* (L. Nichol, Ed.). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203180372

Brown, J., Isaacs, D., Community, W. C., Senge, P., & Wheatley, M. J. (2005). *The World Café: Shaping our futures through conversations that matter* (Illustrated edition). Berrett-Koehler Publishers.

Derrida, J., & Dufourmantelle, A. (2000). *Of hospitality* (R. Bowlby, Trans.). Stanford University Press.

Eviner, İ. (2009). *Harem* [Artist Website]. https://incieviner.net/work/harem/

Freire, P. (2000). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (30 Anv Sub). Continuum.

Hallaq, W. (2018). *Restating orientalism: A critique of modern knowledge*. Columbia University Press.

hooks, bell. (1994). *Teaching to transgress: Education as the practice of freedom*. Routledge.

Iyengar, R. (2018, September 17). Nalini Malani: A memoirist for the Subaltern. *Live Mint.* https://www.livemint.com/Leisure/0t2qPHbXK8BLKPsB0GbHZM/Nalini-Malani-A-memoirist-for-the-Subaltern.html

Khalid, A. (2002). *Conversation* [Double channel video projection]. https://artsandculture.google.com/asset/conversation-aisha-khalid/GwHUORlParYu4Q

Kinsizer. (2025). *Deconstructing an orientalist fantasy of the harem, hammam, and odalisque Through a feminist intersectional postcolonial lens* [Doctoral Dissertation]. University of North Texas Libraries, UNT Digital Library, https://digital.library.unt.edu. https://doi.org/10.12794/metadc2443155

Kristeva, J. (1982). *Powers of horror: An essay on abjection* (L. Roudiez, Trans.). Columbia University Press.

Kristeva, J., & Herman, J. (2010). Liberty, equality, fraternity, and... vulnerability. *Women's Studies Quarterly, 38*(1/2), 251–268.

Ladson-Billings, G. (2005). Differing concepts of citizenship: Schools and communities as sites of civic development. In N. Noddings

(Ed.), *Educating citizens for global awareness* (pp. 69–80). Teachers College Press.

Lewis, R. (2004). *Rethinking orientalism: Women, travel, and the Ottoman harem.* Rutgers University Press.

Lewis, R. (2013). *Gendering orientalism: Race, femininity and representation*. Routledge.

Malani, N. (Director). (1996). *Memory: Record/Erase* [Video recording]. http://www.nalinimalani.com/video/erase.htm

Malani, N. (2005). *Mother India: Transactions in the construction of pain* [Video Installation]. https://www.nalinimalani.com/video/motherindia.htm

Malani, N. (2025). *Installations.* https://www.nalinimalani.com/installations.htm

Massad, J. A. (2008). *Desiring Arabs* (Reprint edition). University of Chicago Press.

McNay, A. (2022, October 1). Shahzia Sikander – interview: 'I usually create a painting as a poem'. *Studio International.* https://www.studiointernational.com/index.php/shahzia-sikander-interview-i-usually-create-a-painting-as-a-poem

Noddings, N. (2005). *Educating citizens for global awareness* (N. Noddings, Ed.). Teachers College Press.

Putzer, A. (2021, May 10). "I Abject" – Julia Kristeva and the colonial gaze. *The new polis: Critical theory, social analysis, political philosophy and theology*. https://thenewpolis.com/2021/05/10/i-abject-julia-kristeva-and-the-colonial-gaze-alyssa-putzer/

Raza, S. (2022). *Punk orientalism: The art of rebellion.* Black Dog Press. https://blackdogonline.com/en-us/products/punk-orientalism

Said, E. W. (1979). *Orientalism* (1st Vintage Books ed). Vintage.

Sharma, M., & Alexander, A. (Eds.). (2023). *The Routledge companion to decolonizing art, craft, and visual culture education*. Routledge.

Sikander, S. (n.d.). *Artworks.* https://www.shahziasikander.com/artworks.

x-ist. (2011). CANAN's Turkish Delight at x-ist. *E-Flux.* https://www.e-flux.com/announcements/187636/canan-s-turkish-delight-at-x-ist/

Yegenoglu, M. (1998). *Colonial fantasies: Towards a feminist reading of orientalism*. Cambridge University Press.