

# ARIZONA

---

## LAW REVIEW

---

VOLUME 56

2014

ISSUE 2

---

### CONTENTS

#### FOREWORD

REMEMBERING MARK HUMMELS

Shane M. Ham 341

#### ESSAY

WHEN JUDGES ERR: IS CONFESSION GOOD FOR  
THE SOUL?

Andrew D. Hurwitz 343

#### ARTICLES:

JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE REVIEW IN ARIZONA: A  
CRITICAL ASSESSMENT

Rebecca White Berch & Erin Norris Bass 353

“IT’S CALLED LUNCH”: JUDICIAL ETHICS AND THE  
POLITICAL AND LEGAL SPACE FOR THE  
JUDICIARY TO “LOBBY”

Dr. Roger E. Hartley 383

DISQUALIFYING JUDGES WHEN THEIR  
IMPARTIALITY MIGHT REASONABLY BE  
QUESTIONED: MOVING BEYOND A FAILED  
STANDARD

Raymond J. McKoski 411

A PRIMER ON REGULATING FEDERAL JUDICIAL  
ETHICS

Russell R. Wheeler 479

### NOTES

HERE TODAY, GONE TOMORROW: "NULLIFYING"  
LAWFUL PERMANENT RESIDENT STATUS

Emily C. Arnold 527

THE SKY'S THE LIMIT: A MODERN APPROACH TO  
AIRPORT SECURITY

Andrea M. Simbro 559

### LAW & POLICY NOTES

FAILING CHARACTER AND FITNESS DUE TO LAW  
SCHOOL DEBT

Andrew Hall 589

SUPERVISORY LIABILITY UNDER 42 U.S.C. § 1983 IN  
THE WAKE OF IQBAL AND CONNICK: IT MAY  
BE MISCONCEIVED, BUT IT'S NOT A  
MISNOMER

Jacob A. Zuniga 601

# ARIZONA

---

## LAW REVIEW

EDITORIAL BOARD 2013–2014

**Editor-in-Chief**

DANIEL A. ARELLANO

**Senior Articles Editor**

KAREN JURICHKO LOWELL

**Senior Managing Editor**

ALEXANDER D. MCCOURT

**Senior Note Editor**

KATHERINE K. LAFOSSE

**Articles Editors**

NICHOLAS BAUMAN

MICHAEL A. DIGIACOMO

JESSICA ELLIS

T. WILLIAM PEW III

CHARLES SCHEURICH

DALE A. SEVIN

**Managing Editors**

KIMBERLY O'HAGAN

JACOB A. ZUNIGA

**Case Notes Editor**

OMAR E. VASQUEZ

**Note Editors**

JUSTIN R. DEPAUL

ZACHARY B. FRIEDMAN

JONATHAN D. LOE

AMANDA MONTEAGUDO

NATHAN D. SCHOTT

DAVID L. UDALL

**Online Editor**

JANA SUTTON

**Articles Manager**

JESSICA BERGER

**Business Manager**

JAYME WEBER

**Syllabus Manager**

VANESSA GARRETT

**Marketing Manager**

TRISTANY LEIKEM

**Events Manager**

RACHAEL PETERS

**Online Manager**

MACKENZIE RICHARDSON

CHAD AMBRODAY

EMILY ARNOLD

SCOTT BONCOSKEY

SEAN A. CAHILL

DAVID DENUYL

REBEKAH ELLIOTT

BYRON H. FORRESTER

COLLEEN GANIN

BRENDAN HABERLE

ANDREW HALL

MICHAEL HARRIS

PATRICK SEAN KELLY

**Members**

ERIC BRYCE KESSLER

MILES KRIEGER

KATYA LANCERO

MATT LAPRADE

REBECCA MASCOT

SARAH MASON

MATTHEW MCCRAY

HEIDI NIELSON

AHREN RICHTER

GABRIELA MAY RIOS

LOGAN ROGERS

KARA SAGI

JESSICA SALYERS

BRIDGET SCHAAF

SARAH SCHADE

MOLLY SCHIFFER

LINDSAY SCHROEDER

ANDREA M. SIMBRO

ALEX TABER

MARIYA D. VARAVVA

CARA WALLACE

CHRISTOPHER WHITE

ALEX WINKELMAN

JEFF WOHLFORD

DEREK E. BAMBAUER

**Faculty Advisors**

DAVID MARCUS

BARAK ORBACH

**Research Advisor**

MICHAEL CHIORAZZI

# JAMES E. ROGERS COLLEGE OF LAW THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

## ADMINISTRATION

ANN WEAVER HART, B.S., M.A., PH.D. .... President, The University of Arizona  
ANDREW COMRIE, B.A., PH.D. .... Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs & Provost  
MARC L. MILLER, B.A., J.D. .... Dean & Ralph W. Bilby Professor of Law  
SALLY RIDER, B.A., J.D. .... Associate Dean for Administration & Chief of Staff  
Director, The William H. Rehnquist Center  
KIRSTEN H. ENGEL, B.A., J.D. .... Associate Dean for Academic Affairs & Professor of Law  
BRENT T. WHITE, B.A., J.D. .... Associate Dean for Programs & Global Initiatives  
Professor of Law  
MICHAEL G. CHIORAZZI, B.A., J.D., M.L.L. .... Associate Dean for Information Services  
Professor of Law  
WILLIE M. JORDAN-CURTIS, B.A., M.A., PH.D., J.D. .... Assistant Dean for Student Affairs  
KAREN M. KOWALSKI, B.A., J.D., LL.M. .... Assistant Dean for Career & Professional Development  
NANCY A. STANLEY, B.A., J.D. .... Assistant Dean for Advancement  
BIANCA MACK, B.A., M.B.A., J.D. .... Assistant Dean for Admissions & Financial Aid  
JONELLE VOLD, B.A., J.D. .... Senior Director of Development  
LEAH WON, B.A., J.D. .... Director, Career & Professional Development  
KELLY M. MOYES, B.A., M.B.A. .... Director of Finance and Administration  
MOHYEDDIN K. ABDULAZIZ, B.A. .... Director of Information Technology  
LEUDELL TRIPP .... Assistant Director for Finance and Administration  
LISSETTE CALDERON, B.A. .... Registrar  
PAUL KEALEY, B.S., LL.M. .... Internet Developer

## FACULTY

S. JAMES ANAYA, B.A., J.D. .... Regents Professor & James J. Lenoir Professor of Human Rights Law &  
Policy  
DEREK BAMBAUER, B.A., J.D. .... Associate Professor of Law  
JANE BAMBAUER, B.A., J.D. .... Associate Professor of Law  
KATHERINE BARNES, B.A., M.S., J.D., PH.D. .... Associate Professor of Law  
Director, Rogers Program on Law & Society  
PAUL D. BENNETT, B.A., J.D. .... Clinical Professor of Law  
Co-Director, Child and Family Law Clinic  
JEAN BRAUCHER, A.B., J.D. .... Roger Henderson Professor of Law  
ELLEN M. BUBLICK, B.A., J.D. .... Dan B. Dobbs Professor of Law  
SHUN-LING CHEN, B.A., J.D. .... Visiting Assistant Professor of Law  
DAVID A. GANTZ, A.B., J.D., J.S.M. .... Samuel M. Fegtly Professor of Law  
Director, International Trade Law Program  
Associate Director, National Law Center for Inter-American Free Trade  
LORRAINE C. GIN, B.A., J.D. .... Assistant Professor of Legal Writing  
ROBERT J. GLENNON, A.B., J.D., M.A., PH.D. .... Regents Professor & Morris K. Udall Professor of Law &  
Public Policy  
Director, Environmental Law, Science & Policy Programs  
ROBERT ALAN HERSHEY, B.S., J.D. .... Director, Indigenous Peoples Law Clinic  
Professor of Practice  
JAMES C. HOPKINS, B.A., J.D., LL.M. .... Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
MONA L. HYMEL, B.A., J.D., C.P.A. .... Arthur W. Andrews Professor of Law  
BORIS KOZOLCHYK, D.C.L., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D. .... Evo A. DeConcini Professor of Law  
Director, National Law Center for Inter-American Free Trade  
JASON KREAG, B.A., M.A., J.D. .... Visiting Assistant Professor of Law  
DAVID MARCUS, B.A., J.D. .... Professor of Law  
LYNN MARCUS, B.A., J.D. .... Director, Immigration Law Clinic  
Professor of Practice  
TONI M. MASSARO, B.S., J.D. .... Regents Professor & Milton O. Riepe Chair in Constitutional Law  
THOMAS A. MAUET, A.B., J.D. .... Milton O. Riepe Professor of Law  
Director, Trial Advocacy  
ANA MARIA MERICO, B.A., J.D. .... Associate Professor of Law  
ROBERT MUNDHEIM, B.A., J.D. .... Professor of Corporate Law and Finance  
LESLEY AMEDE OBIORA, LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D. .... Professor of Law  
BARAK ORBACH, LL.B., B.A., LL.M., S.J.D. .... Professor of Law  
LAWRENCE PONOROFF, B.A., J.D. .... Samuel M. Fegtly Chair in Commercial Law  
SUZANNE M. RABE, B.A., J.D. .... Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, Legal Writing

NINA RABIN, B.A., J.D. .... Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
 Director, Bacon Immigration Law and Policy Program  
 JAMIE R. RATNER, A.B., M.A., J.D. .... Professor of Law  
 CHRISTOPHER ROBERTSON, B.A., M.A., PH.D., J.D. .... Associate Professor of Law  
 CAROL M. ROSE, B.A., M.A., PH.D., J.D. .... Lohse Chair in Water and Natural Resources  
 SUSAN SALMON, B.A., J.D. .... Assistant Director of Legal Writing  
 Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
 SIMONE M. SEPE, J.D., LL.M., PH.D., M.Sc., J.S.D. .... Associate Professor of Law  
 WILLIAM K. SJOSTROM, B.S., J.D. .... Professor of Law  
 ROY G. SPECE JR., B.A., J.D. .... Professor of Law  
 JOHN A. SWAIN, A.B., J.D. .... Professor of Law  
 MELISSA L. TATUM, B.A., J.D. .... Research Professor of Law  
 Associate Director, Indigenous Peoples Law & Policy Program  
 ROBERT A. WILLIAMS JR., A.B., J.D. .... E. Thomas Sullivan Professor of Law & American  
 Indian Studies, Director, Indigenous Peoples Law & Policy Program

**EMERITI FACULTY**

ARTHUR W. ANDREWS, B.A., LL.B., LL.M. .... Rosenstiel Distinguished Professor of Law Emeritus  
 CHARLES E. ARES, J.D. .... J. Byron McCormick Professor of Law Emeritus  
 BARBARA ANN ATWOOD, B.A., J.D. .... Mary Anne Richey Professor of Law Emerita  
 WILLIAM E. BOYD, A.B., J.D., LL.M. .... Chester H. Smith Professor of Law Emeritus  
 DAN B. DOBBS, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D. .... Regents & Rosenstiel Distinguished  
 Professor of Law Emeritus  
 KENNEY F. HEGLAND, B.A., LL.B., LL.M. .... James E. Rogers Professor of Law Emeritus  
 ROGER C. HENDERSON, B.B.A., LL.B., LL.M. .... Ralph W. Bilby Professor of Law Emeritus  
 KAY KAVANAGH, B.A., J.D. .... Professor of Law Emeritus  
 THEODORE J. SCHNEYER, A.B., LL.B., J.S.M. .... Milton O. Riepe Professor of Law Emeritus  
 ANDREW SILVERMAN, J.D. .... Joseph M. Livermore Professor of Law Emeritus  
 JOHN STRONG, B.A., J.D. .... Rosenstiel Distinguished Professor of Law Emeritus  
 ELLIOTT J. WEISS, B.A., LL.B. .... Charles E. Ares Professor of Law Emeritus  
 DAVID B. WEXLER, B.A., J.D. .... Distinguished Research Professor of Law Emeritus  
 WINTON D. WOODS, A.B., J.D. .... Professor of Law Emeritus

## **ARIZONA LAW REVIEW SUPPORTERS**

The Arizona Law Review thanks the following  
generous organizations and individuals who  
contributed funds during 2011–2014:

Arizona Law Review Alumni Association

Timothy J. Berg

Carla Consoli

Alexis E. Danneman

Emily L. Gust

Stuart Kottle

Dan Marks

Patricia Martin

LexisNexis

Barak Orbach

Polsinelli

Jessica L. Post

Osborne M. Reynolds, Jr.

Bob & Elise Rose

Lena Ryan

Snell & Wilmer LLP

Steptoe & Johnson LLP

Kara E. Tatman

Please make your tax-deductible contributions payable to:

“Law College Association—Arizona Law Review”

Arizona Law Review

James E. Rogers College of Law

The University of Arizona

P.O. Box 210176

Tucson, AZ 85721

Online giving is also available at:

<https://www.law.arizona.edu/Alumni/onlinegiving.cfm>

# ARIZONA LAW REVIEW ENDOWMENT

**In recognition of the 50th Anniversary of the Arizona Law Review  
and to provide a stable future for the publication,  
the 2008 Editorial Board and alumni established the  
Arizona Law Review Endowment.**

The Arizona Law Review thanks the following generous individuals who  
contributed funds to the endowment:

Bryce C. Alstead	Scott P. Hill-Kennedy
Emily L. Alstead	Dennis G. Katz
Eric S. Baker	Desmond P. Kearns
Janet L. Kisinger	Jack P. Lipton
Stacy R. Butler	Andrew T. Maccabe
Grace E. Campbell	Daniel G. Martin
Claudia L. Cerutti	Toni M. Massaro
Matthew D. Clark	Ralph R. Mazzeo
Corinne Cooper	John G. Osborne
David L. Deibel	April S. Phillips Elliott
Alexis E. Danneman	Osborne M. Reynolds
Brett L. Dunkelman	Todd W. Roles
Elizabeth Fimbres	James M. Sakrison
Jennifer L. Gibbons	Frances R. Sjoberg
Richard Goldsmith	Ryan J. Talamante
John A. Harwood	Verizon Foundation
Edwin F. Hendricks	David Wheeler
J. Michael Hennigan	Michael N. Widener

Please make your tax-deductible contribution payable to:  
“Law College Association—Arizona Law Review Endowment”

and send to:  
Arizona Law Review  
James E. Rogers College of Law  
The University of Arizona  
P.O. Box 210176  
Tucson, Arizona 85721

Online giving is also available at:  
<https://www.law.arizona.edu/Alumni/onlinegiving.cfm>

If you are interested in making a planned gift (e.g., gifts in trusts and wills) to  
support the Arizona Law Review Endowment, please call (520) 621-8430.